

# SILLIMAN JOURNAL



**EDITORIAL POLICY**

# Silliman Journal

Silliman University  
Dumaguete City  
Philippines

**WRITTEN AND PRODUCED BY**  
DR. CERES PIOQUINTO  
DR. MARGARET HELEN U. ALVAREZ  
PROF. GINA FONTEJON-BONIOR  
PROF. IAN ROSALES CASOCOT  
PROF. SHERRO LEE LAGRIMAS

23 SEPTEMBER 2008

**REVISED BY**  
DR. MARGARET HELEN U. ALVAREZ  
PROF. GINA FONTEJON-BONIOR  
PROF. WARLITO CATURAY JR.  
PROF. IAN ROSALES CASOCOT  
MS. NENITH CALIBO

5 JANUARY 2014

## EDITORIAL POLICIES

### MISSION STATEMENT

Silliman Journal (SJ) is an interdisciplinary peer refereed academic journal of Silliman University. SJ continues to commit to its mission of providing an avenue for scholarly dialogues not only among members of the Silliman academic community but also among its international readership. SJ aims to continue the dissemination of results of scholarly inquiry, to endeavor to create opportunities for Silliman faculty and other scholars to engage in writing and publication, and to strive to maintain excellence in academic research, scholarship and publication.

## GENERAL DESCRIPTION

1. The SILLIMAN JOURNAL is devoted to discussion and investigation in the humanities, social sciences, and sciences, and is published by Silliman University, Dumaguete City, Philippines. SJ publishes two issues per year, and has more than 200 journal exchanges with educational institutions, government bodies, and non-government organizations worldwide.
2. It is indexed in the Modern Language Association (MLA) Bibliography; BIOSIS (now ZOOLOGICAL RECORDS), which publishes indexes and abstracts in Biology; ULRICH International Periodicals Directory, New Jersey, USA; the University Microfilms International, Michigan, USA; and the Index to Philippine Periodicals, among others. SJ is available in microfilm format at the University Microfilms International, Michigan, USA.
3. The policies and practices of the SILLIMAN JOURNAL are based on formal actions of the SILLIMAN JOURNAL Editorial Board and on informal consensus and tradition.

## PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF THE SILLIMAN JOURNAL

4. The SILLIMAN JOURNAL welcomes contributions in all fields from both Philippine and foreign scholars, but papers should preferably have some relevance to the Philippines, Asia, or the Pacific.
5. Articles should be products of research, taken in its broadest sense; a scientific paper should make an original contribution to its field. Authors are advised to keep in mind that SILLIMAN JOURNAL has a general and international readership, and to structure their papers accordingly. (These articles may be referred to in the following pages as “full-length articles.”)
6. The SILLIMAN JOURNAL also welcomes the submission of “Notes,” which generally are briefer and more tentative than full-length articles. Reports on work in progress, queries, updates, reports of impressions rather than research, responses to the works of others (“Readers Forum”), even reminiscences are appropriate here. Book reviews and review articles will also be considered for publication.
7. The SILLIMAN JOURNAL may also publish official documents of Silliman University.

## EDITORIAL INSTRUCTIONS

8. Manuscripts should conform to the conventions of format and style exemplified in a typical issue of Silliman Journal. Whenever possible, citations should appear in the body of the paper, holding footnotes to a minimum. Documentation of sources should be discipline-based.
9. Tables, illustrations, pictures, and figures will be accepted only when absolutely necessary. Tables must not exceed five in number. Colored pictures and illustrations may be included at the printing expense of the author(s).
10. All submitted manuscripts must be accompanied by an abstract of not more than 200 words, and keywords of not more than 10 words.
11. All submitted manuscripts must use gender-fair language.
12. All submitted manuscripts should not exceed 10,000 words in length, excluding references, tables, and figures.
13. Submissions must be electronically mailed as .rtf attachments.
14. All full-length articles submitted to the SILLIMAN JOURNAL are carefully refereed by qualified specialists in particular fields of study before they can be accepted for publication. This is to ensure the quality—that the work is original, valid, and significant—of each contribution. (See Appendix A: Peer Review Guidelines)
15. The SILLIMAN JOURNAL accepts only primary publication for all submitted full-length articles. The characteristics of primary, or original, publication are that
  - (a) articles represent research not previously published;
  - (b) articles are reviewed by peers before being accepted or rejected by the SILLIMAN JOURNAL; and
  - (c) articles are archival, or retrievable for future references.

The standard of primary publication is supported by the peer-reviewed system and protected by policies that prohibit multiple submission and duplicate publication.

However, while SJ has first rights over an article, it can give permission to republish/reprint an article in another publication (e.g. the author's book, etc.) on condition that SJ will be properly/publicly acknowledged as the original source. The advancement of technology also means that authors/sponsoring groups may request

permission for PDF copies of their published articles to be uploaded into their websites. The EIC can give this permission.

16. The SILLIMAN JOURNAL accepts only primary publication for all submitted articles for the “Notes” section. The article must not be previously published.
17. The rejection of articles for publication may be due to inability to follow the above instructions, or failure to pass the evaluation standards of the peer review. The EIC may endeavor to locate another, preferably independent, reviewer. See Peer Review Procedures.

## EDITORIAL STAFF

### DEFINITIONS OF ROLES, RIGHTS, AND RESPONSIBILITIES

18. The Vice President for Academic Affairs of Silliman University, upon recommendation by the SILLIMAN JOURNAL Editorial Board, appoints the Editorial Staff of the Journal consisting of an Editor-in-Chief; Associate Editors; a production editor; and a Business Manager. The positions should be filled from the ranks of the University faculty. The VPAA shall consider the following criteria for choosing the EIC and the other staff: expertise, experience, credentials, publishing know-how, commitment to the job, and knowledge of journal’s varied subjects.

19. The roles of the EDITOR-IN-CHIEF (EIC) are defined as follows:

*(a) Responsibility for quality of content*

- (1) The Editor-in-Chief of the SILLIMAN JOURNAL has the editorial responsibility for the journal and is therefore responsible for its quality;
- (2) The EIC sets up the Editorial Staff of Associate Editors who are subsequently recommended by the Editorial Board, and given official appointment by the Vice President for Academic Affairs.
- (3) The EIC, with the assistance of the Associate and the Production Editors, plans Special Issues and sends out Call for Papers. This includes determining the theme/topic and potential authors, referees, and guest editors.
- (4) The EIC is responsible for implementing and applying the Editorial Policies of the Journal, for maintaining a high level of quality in the editing process, and for applying ethical standards.

- (5) The EIC ensures that full-length articles are facilitated according to the Production Process approved by the Editorial Board.
- (6) The EIC mediates between the Editorial Board, the authors, and the referees in all matters concerning the operation of the Journal.
- (7) The EIC writes the Editorial Notes and the Introduction segments of the Journal.

*(b) Responsibilities to authors*

- (1) The Editor-in-Chief of the SILLIMAN JOURNAL writes the Call for Papers.
- (2) The EIC, in coordination with the Associate Editors, is responsible for soliciting full-length articles and notes for the journal.
- (3) The EIC shall promptly inform the contributors on the referees' comments and suggestions on the article based on the Peer Review Guidelines.

*(c) Responsibilities to peer referees*

- (1) The Editor-in-Chief of the SILLIMAN JOURNAL is responsible for inviting both foreign and local specialists to review the manuscripts submitted for publication to SJ. The EIC assigns papers for review appropriate to the reviewer/s' area of expertise or specialization.
- (2) The EIC shall remind the referees on publication schedules to ensure that the referees have sufficient time to review the articles.
- (3) The EIC updates the referees on the progress of articles based on their comments and suggestions.
- (4) The EIC, with the assistance of the Associate Editors, adjudicates manuscripts when peer reviewers disagree on the disposition of the article, after submitting the paper to at least one more reviewer.
- (5) The EIC shall ensure that referees are properly acknowledged; however, the identity of specialists on the topic who prefer to conduct blind referees shall remain confidential.

*(d) Responsibilities to readers*

- (1) The Editor-in-Chief of the SILLIMAN JOURNAL shall facilitate the continuous publication of the Readers Forum, where readers could respond to articles published at the SJ.
- (2) The EIC, in coordination with the Business Manager, is responsible for enhancing the impact factor of the Journal through effective and efficient exchange of journals with other academic institutions. The EIC works with the Business Manager in designing promotional and marketing schemes for the journal, with input from the Editorial Board.

*(e) Responsibilities to Editorial Board*

- (1) The Editor-in-Chief of the SILLIMAN JOURNAL makes periodic assessments of the general Editorial Staff, and recommends changes when appropriate.
- (2) The EIC reports periodically to the Editorial Board on the progress of the journal production.

20. The rights of the EIC are defined as follows:

To establish and maintain high-quality journal content, an editor has the right at the beginning of his or her employment to receive an explicit written statement from the journal's publisher (Silliman University) that defines the editor's rights and autonomy. The editor's right to editorial freedom must be supported by the following to be agreed upon by both editor and publisher:

- A journal mission statement.
- Written editorial priorities.
- Written editorial policies.
- A written job description, specifically detailing components of editorial freedom regarding control over acceptance and publication of original content, degree of control over advertising content, etc.
- An editorial board that is appointed by the Vice President for Academic Affairs based on the recommendation of the Editor. Direct lines of communication with the Silliman University Administration
- Sufficient and consistent support from Silliman University Administration in both funding and staff to carry out the journal's stated mission.
- Preferably, a mechanism for regular and objective evaluation of journal performance by a body created by the University for such purpose.

21. The roles, qualifications, and responsibilities of the ASSOCIATE EDITORS (AE) are defined as follows:

- (a) The AE/s assist the EIC in all matters pertaining to the Journal.
- (b) The AE/s familiarize themselves with all aspects of the Journal content so that they could substitute the EIC should that become necessary.
- (c) The AE/s may be designated by the EIC to write the Editorial Notes and Introduction for particular issues.
- (d) The AE/s advise submitting authors on matters pertaining to the Editorial Policies and Production Process, and assist them in the production of their articles.
- (e) The AE/s make sure the articles submitted have abstracts and keywords.
- (f) The AE/s create a pool of proofreaders, preferably from the Editorial Board Members.
- (g) The AE/s assist the EIC in selecting reviewers.
- (h) The AE/s assist the EIC in reading the reviews and adjudicating manuscripts when peer reviewers disagree on the disposition of the article.
- (i) The AE/s proofread articles.
- (j) The AE/s assist the EIC and the Production Editor in planning Special Issues. This includes determining the theme/topic and potential authors, referees, and, as the need arises, also guest/issue editors.
- (k) The AE/s assist the EIC in soliciting papers for publication.
- (l) The AE/s assist the EIC in reviewing the papers.

22. The roles of the PRODUCTION EDITOR (PE) are defined as follows:

- (a) The PE, in collaboration with EIC & AE/s, is responsible for designing the journal layout, format, cover design, art work, and other production concepts.
- (b) The PE must make an electronic file in PDF of the camera-ready version for record/archival purposes (e.g., when authors/sponsoring groups requests PDF files of articles for uploading into their websites.)



- (c) The PE ensures that production guidelines are strictly followed and that deadlines are met.
- (d) The PE works with the EIC and AE/s in supervising copy-editing and proofreading functions to ensure that the publication is factually and grammatically correct and the Editorial Policies strictly followed.
- (e) The PE personally delivers the camera-ready volume to the Press, oversees the printing/production of the journal, and receives the finish product.
- (f) The PE familiarizes himself/herself with the functions of the AE/s so that s/he could substitute the AE should that become necessary.

23. The roles of the BUSINESS MANAGER (BM) are defined as follows:

- (a) The BM directs and coordinates the circulation of the Journal.
- (b) The BM ensures that individual authors immediately get one complimentary copy of the issue. Regardless of the number of authors, only ten (10) copies of the off-prints for each published article shall be furnished.
- (c) The BM ensures that contributors, peer reviewers, and subscribers promptly receive copies of the Journal.
- (d) The BM is responsible for enhancing the impact factor of the journal through effective and efficient exchange of journals with other academic institutions.
- (e) The BM tracks and reports on circulation goals in relation to the budget.
- (f) The BM is responsible for strategic planning, promotion, and marketing efforts to keep the journal financially viable.
- (g) The BM is responsible for preparing the budget as well as auditing reports.
- (h) The BM deals with the press and handles the financial aspect of the production, e.g., processing the requisition forms, and other related tasks.

24. The Editorial Staff serves a term of two (2) years. This term is renewable based on the performance of the staff member, as recommended by the EIC and appointed by the VPAA.

## EDITORIAL BOARD

25. The Vice President for Academic Affairs (VPAA) of Silliman University, upon the recommendation/nomination of the EIC, appoints the members of the Editorial Board of the SILLIMAN JOURNAL. The Board consists of a (1) University Editorial Board with 7-10 members, and an (2) Overseas Editorial Board with 4-7 members. The positions of the University Editorial Board should be filled from the ranks of the University faculty. The VPAA convenes the University Editorial Board, which subsequently elects the chair.
26. The EIC, along with the VPAA, has the freedom to choose prospective members of the Editorial Board who share the vision and goals of the journal. Composition of the Editorial Board depends on the individual's disciplinary background and the following criteria:
  - Publication involvement and experience
  - Research activities and productivity
  - Academic credentials
  - Scholarly integrity
  - Creativity
27. The roles of the CHAIR of the Editorial Board are defined as follows:
  - (a) The Chair prepares the agenda for regular and special meetings.
  - (b) The Chair presides regular and special meetings.
  - (c) The Chair assists the EIC and the AE/s in soliciting papers and locating reviewers.
  - (d) The Chair works with the EIC and the AE/s in ensuring that the Editorial Policies and the Production Process are strictly followed.
  - (e) The Chair is responsible for ensuring that the Editorial Staff gets sufficient financial support from the Silliman University Administration for the prompt production of the issues.
  - (f) The Chair works closely with the Vice President for Academic Affairs, who is an ex-officio of the Board, in ensuring that the journal abides by University policies and regulations.
  - (g) The Chair acts a liaison between the Journal and the Administration in matters pertaining to the administration and management of the Journal.

- (h) The Chair assists the EIC and the AE/s in soliciting and acquiring suitable papers for the Journal by inviting colleagues to submit articles and/or notes to the Journal.
- (i) The Chair must demonstrate keen interest in research and publication and is expected to submit at least one (1) full-length article during his/her term.
- (j) The Chair assists in proofreading articles.
- (k) The Chair shall ensure that a Memorandum of Agreement with sponsoring organizations/groups of special or funded issues and the University, through the VPAA, be signed to establish the parameters of relations between the sponsoring agency and SJ.

28. The roles of the MEMBERS of the Editorial Board are defined as follows:

- (a) The Editorial Board Members assist the EIC and the AE/s in soliciting and acquiring suitable papers for the Journal from their respective colleagues.
- (b) The Editorial Board Members shall critically review and evaluate all articles for the Notes Section, when such articles are related to their areas of specialization.
- (c) The Editorial Board Members ensure that the EIC receives sufficient financial support from the administration to allow the timely publication of the issues.
- (d) The Editorial Board Members must demonstrate keen interest in research and publication; they are expected to submit at least one (1) article during their term.
- (e) The Editorial Board Members assist in proofreading articles. Therefore, the membership must be as diverse as the disciplinary coverage of SJ.
- (f) The Editorial Board Members should take more active role in developing SJ and promoting the publication through membership in committees such as (1) manuscripts committee (responsible mainly for locating manuscripts), (2) finance committee (locating funding or generating income through special issues or special projects, drawing budgets, directing assisting/advising the BM); and (3) special projects (planning and coordinating lecture series, writing/publication seminar-workshops, book launchings, etc.).

29. The members of the Editorial Board serve a term of two (2) years. The term is renewable based on the performance of the member, and as appointed by the VPAA.

30. The Editorial Board Members are encouraged to recommend and help locate international experts who will referee particular articles.

## **EDITORIAL PROCESS**

31. The approved publication process must be followed, from submission of articles to publication of the same. (See Appendix B: Publication Process Chart)
32. Researchers must make their data available to the editors at any time during the review and production process if questions arise with respect to the accuracy of the report. Otherwise, the submitted manuscript may be rejected.
33. Authors will be sent PDF copies of the camera-ready version sent by electronic mail, or of the galleys sent by mail, and must carefully review these and indicate their final approval of the pre-published form through written notification to the Editorial Staff. If, however, the author does not respond within one (1) week, the Editorial Staff reserves the right to continue with the publication process.
34. The Editorial Staff must endeavor to maintain a publication lag—the interval between the date a manuscript is accepted and the date the manuscript is published—that averages six (6) months.
35. The Editorial Staff will endeavor to acknowledge all submissions, consider them promptly, and notify authors of its decision as soon as possible.

## **PEER REVIEW**

36. REVIEWERS will evaluate each submitted manuscript based on the following criteria:
  - a. Significance of themes
  - b. Relevance of themes
  - c. Clarity of thematic focus
  - d. Relationship to literature
  - e. Research design and data
  - f. Data analysis and use of data
  - g. Use of theory
  - h. Critical qualities
  - i. Clarity of conclusions
  - j. Quality of communication

Each reviewer is provided an evaluation sheet that has full and detailed description of each criterion. (Please refer to Peer Review Guidelines.)

In some instances, e.g., controversial papers, reviewers might request to see the revised version of the paper they have reviewed to make sure that the questions raised in the review have been addressed and the comments incorporated in the revision.

37. The following are the AUTHOR/s' responsibilities:

- a. The authors must carefully review the PDF copies of the camera-ready version sent to them by electronic mail, or of the galleys sent by mail, and indicate their final approval of the pre-published form through written notification to the Editorial Staff. If, however, the author does not respond within one (1) week, the Editorial Staff reserves the right to continue with the publication process.
- b. The author must notify the Chair of the Editorial Board and/or the EIC if an article published in the journal will be published elsewhere. Since the Journal holds the copyright of the article, this should be indicated in any further reprinting or use of the same.

38. The editors and reviewers may not use the material from an unpublished manuscript to advance their own or others' work without the author's consent.

### OTHER EDITORIAL CONSIDERATIONS

39. **Regarding revisions.** Authors are obliged to review every page of the article before the mass production of the journal. Any errors in relation to content are the sole responsibility of the author, not the journal. However, such errors must be printed as ERRATA in the succeeding issue. Moreover, SJ will make sure that all mechanisms in place to maintain the credibility of the journal are strictly adhered to.
40. **Regarding errors.** The Editorial Staff will endeavor to do careful preparation of the submitted manuscripts for publication. It is the author's responsibility to make such errors public if they are discovered after publication. The first step is to inform the Editorial Staff and Editorial Board so that a correction notice can be published. Corrections published in the SILLIMAN JOURNAL are linked with the original article in the database so that the correction will be retrieved whenever the original article is retrieved.

41. **Regarding plagiarism.** The authors of the articles must not claim the words and ideas of another as their own. Proper citation must be observed. Plagiarized manuscripts will be rejected. Instances of plagiarism for articles already published must be dealt with by a disclaimer published in the Journal in the next possible issue.

The SILLIMAN JOURNAL endeavors to curb any possibility of publishing plagiarized manuscripts by asking each author to sign a Note of Ethical Compliance before the publication of articles.

42. **Regarding authorship.** Authorship is reserved for persons who receive primary credit and hold primary responsibility for a published work. This includes not only those who do the actual writing but also those who have made substantial academic contributions to the study. Substantial professional contributions may include formulating the problem or hypothesis, structuring the experimental design, organizing and conducting the statistical analysis, interpreting the results, or writing a major portion of the paper. Those who so contribute are listed in the byline. Lesser contributions, which do not constitute authorship, may be acknowledged in a note.
43. **Regarding author photographs.** Photographs of the author may be included for award-related articles and in special features.

## INCENTIVES TO AUTHORS

44. Each full-length article is entitled to ten (10) off-print copies of the published article, regardless of the number of authors while each author gets one (1) copy of the full volume. Additional copies are available by arrangement with the Editor or Business Manager before the issue goes to press.

## COPYRIGHT OF ARTICLES

45. The copyright of all published articles in the SILLIMAN JOURNAL is held by the journal and the individual authors.
46. The SILLIMAN JOURNAL ensures copyright protection by including copyright notice on all published works.
47. Authors are protected by copyright against unauthorized use of their unpublished manuscripts. An unpublished work is copyrighted from the moment it is fixed in tangible form. Until the author formally transfers co-ownership of the copyright to the SILLIMAN JOURNAL, the author solely owns the copyright of an unpublished

manuscript, and all the exclusive rights due to the owner of the copyright are also due the author of an unpublished work.

48. Complaints regarding suspected infringement of the author's copyright on a manuscript submitted to the SILLIMAN JOURNAL should be referred to the Chair of the Editorial Board of the Journal.
49. Authors signify co-ownership of the copyright to the SILLIMAN JOURNAL once their articles are published.
50. Because of co-ownership of copyright, the author must obtain permission and/or notify the Editorial Board of SILLIMAN JOURNAL if published articles will be entered into any kind of competition, or if published articles will be included in a book by the author, or in a book compiled and edited by another, or published on official websites of authors or sponsoring groups.
51. Researchers who wish to reproduce a SILLIMAN JOURNAL article in full, to quote text of more than 500 words, or to copy two or more tables or figures must secure written permission from the SILLIMAN JOURNAL and from the author of the reproduced material. SILLIMAN JOURNAL normally grants permission contingent on permission by the author; inclusion of the copyright notice on the first page of the reproduced material; and payment of a fee per table, figure, or page. Requests for permission to reproduce material should be directed to the SILLIMAN JOURNAL Editorial Board Chair.
52. SILLIMAN JOURNAL requires no written permissions or fees when
  - (a) authors of manuscripts being considered for publication reproduce or adapt a single table or figure from an article, provided that permission from the author of the original published work is obtained and that full credit is given to that author and to SILLIMAN JOURNAL as copyright holder through a complete and accurate citation;
  - (b) authors reproduce their own materials for personal use—however, if they use their own material commercially, authors must secure prior written permission from the SILLIMAN JOURNAL;
  - (c) instructors and educational institutions photocopy isolated articles for nonprofit classroom or library reserve use; and
  - (d) abstracting and indexing services use abstracts.

## SUBSCRIPTION

53. The annual subscription rates for the SILLIMAN JOURNAL, for local subscribers and for overseas subscribers, are subject to change and are exclusive of postage and handling cost. Purchase price of individual copies shall be determined based on current production cost.
54. The Business Manager is tasked to handle subscriptions and orders for current and back issues.

## REFERENCES

- American Psychological Association. (2001). Publication manual of the American Psychological Association, (5th ed). Washington, D.C.: Author.
- Anderson, Norman B. (2006, January). Editorial policies of the American Psychologist. *American Psychologist*, 61(1), 1-9.
- Council of Science Editors. (2006). CSE's White Paper on promoting integrity in scientific journal publications. Council of Science Editors Website. [[http://www.councilscienceeditors.org/editorial\\_policies/white\\_paper.cfm](http://www.councilscienceeditors.org/editorial_policies/white_paper.cfm)] (Retrieved, February 1, 2007).
- EuroSpace. Job description of editor-in-chief. European Society of Cardiology Website. [[http://www.escardio.org/NR/rdonlyres/EB2E193C-9476-4F95-A58B-98D7EC2255BF/0/Europace\\_EditorChief\\_Job.pdf](http://www.escardio.org/NR/rdonlyres/EB2E193C-9476-4F95-A58B-98D7EC2255BF/0/Europace_EditorChief_Job.pdf)] (Retrieved March 15, 2007).
- International Association for Dance Medicine & Science. Publications. Journal of International Association for Dance Medicine & Science Website. [<http://www.iadms.org/displaycommon.cfm?an=1&subarticlenbr=42>] (Retrieved March 15, 2007).
- Pioquinto, C. E. (2004). Editor's Notes. *Silliman Journal: Golden Anniversary Humanities Issue*, 45 (1), pp. 7-26



## APPENDIX A

### Peer Review Guidelines

Dear Referee,

Thank you very much in advance for agreeing to referee the following paper for Silliman Journal. As a member of a community of scholars and educators, your help in providing critical and constructive feedback on the work of peers cannot be overstressed. Silliman Journal appreciates your help in making sure that only high quality papers are published, and that the author/s are protected from putting poor work into print.

Although discretion to publish remains with the editors, the greater part of that decision is often based on your comments. Thus, you are strongly encouraged to provide incisive, reasoned, and helpful feedback to authors. As a referee, you have an option to remain anonymous and the Editorial Board will handle your comments confidentially.

Silliman Journal will acknowledge your contribution as reviewer by including your name in the Board of Reviewers for the specific issue in which you have contributed (although, of course, the particular papers you refereed will not be identified).

### Evaluation Criteria

#### 1. Significance of Themes

- Is this a topic that needs addressing?
- Is the area investigated by the paper: timely? important? in need of addressing because it has been neglected? intrinsically interesting? filling a gap in current knowledge? (The paper does not have to be all of these things to be significant; it is sufficient to measure it against one of these forms of significance.)
- By addressing these themes, does this paper make a useful contribution?
- Is the paper significant and original? Does it provide new information?

#### 2. Relevance of Themes

- Are these themes relevant to this publication?
- If not, is there a more appropriate place for publication?

### **3. Clarity of Thematic Focus**

- Are the author's themes clearly stated?
- Does the paper follow through by addressing these themes, consistently and cogently?
- Does the paper show argumentative soundness? Is the paper logically organized and easy to follow?

### **4. Relationship to Literature**

- Does the paper demonstrate an adequate understanding of the current literature in the field?
- Does it connect with the literature in a way which might be useful to the development of our understanding in the area it addresses?

### **5. Research Design and Data**

- Does the paper show an adequate knowledge of research within the field?
- Has the intellectual work that is the basis for this paper been built on adequate evidence, informational input, or other intellectual raw materials?
- Has the research or equivalent intellectual work on which the paper is based been well designed?

### **6. Data Analysis and Use of Data**

- Has the interpretative potential of the data been realized?
- Has the data been used effectively to advance the themes that the paper sets out to address?
- Has the study been conducted in an appropriate manner with respect to its aims?

### **7. Use of Theory**

- Does the paper employ theory in meaningful way?
- Does it use theoretical concepts in such a way as to make plausible generalizations?

### **8. Critical Qualities**

- Does the paper demonstrate a critical self-awareness of the author's own perspectives and interests?

- Does it show awareness of the possibility of alternative or competing perspectives: such as other cultural, social, political, theoretical or intellectual perspectives?
- Does it show an awareness of the practical implications of the ideas it is advancing?

## **9. Clarity of Conclusions**

- Are the conclusions of the paper clearly stated?
- Cohesiveness of paper: do the conclusions adequately tie together the other elements of the paper (such as theory, data and critical perspectives)?

## **10. Quality of Communication**

- Does the paper clearly express its case, measured against the technical language of the field and the reading capacities of an academic, tertiary student and professional readership?
- What is the standard of the writing, including spelling and grammar? If you will be recommending publication with revisions, please make specific suggestions or list errors.

## **Recommendation**

On the basis of the above evaluation, you may recommend:

- ☐ Acceptance
- ☐ Acceptance with minor revisions
- ☐ Resubmit with major revisions
- ☐ Rejection

### Referee Information

Note: This page will be deleted when your report is sent back to the author. But this information is important for our future reference, as well as when we send you a complimentary copy of the issue in which you contributed.

Name of Referee	:	_____
Position	:	_____
Department, Centre, Unit, Faculty	:	_____
University, College, School	:	_____
Mail Address	:	_____
City or Suburb	:	_____
State	:	_____
Postal or Zip Code	:	_____
Country	:	_____
Email	:	_____

## APPENDIX B

### Editorial Process

